



FACULTY PERSONNEL COMMITTEE AGENDA

Friday, September 20, 2024 ~ 10:00 am – 1:00 pm

In-person: Moot Court (6.68 NB)

Meeting Convened: 10:13am

Meeting Adjourned: 12:04pm

Open meeting attendees:

Michael Brownstein, Claudia Calirman, Anthony Carpi, Angela Crossman, Susannah Crowder, Crystal Endsley Taylor, Gail Garfield, Jay Gates, John Gutierrez, Richard Haw, Shweta Jain, Erica King-Toler, Ali Kocak, Vicente Lecuna, Maxwell Mak, Evan Mandery, Simone Martin-Howard, Karol Mason, Adam Mckible, Mickey Melendez, Jean Mills, Allison Pease, Nicholas Petraco, Jason Rivera, Jennifer Rosati, Stephen Russell, Ellen Sexton, Andrew Sidman, Edward Snajdr, John Staines

9:30 am – 9:55 am – Meeting check-in/sign-in. *Light morning Refreshments provided*

Meeting Open to the Public 10:00 am – 12:00 pm

- I. Welcome
- II. Approval of Minutes, 05/10/24 meeting
Motion approved
- III. Charge to the FPC (*President Mason & Provost Pease*)
President Mason & Provost Pease discussed protocols and urged committee members to read the Faculty Personnel Process Guidelines to further their understanding of the guidance
- IV. Fall 2024 Personnel Process (*Faculty Services*)
K. Bailey discussed items below and directed committee members to FPC's CUNY DropBox for referenced materials and voting documents
 - Overview of Fall 2024 personnel process
 - File review and voting protocols (FIDO, Quorum, Simply Voting, etc.)
 - Role and responsibilities of Committee members
- V. FPPG Revisions: Lecturer Reclassification (*Angela Crossman*)
Motion approved
- VI. FPPG Revisions: Adjunct Promotional Reclassification (*Angela Crossman*)
Motion approved
- VII. New Business and Announcements

Executive Session – Full Faculty Personnel Committee 12:00 pm – 12:30 pm*

Initial Appointments without Tenure (Fall 2024 & Spring 2025)

The Faculty Personnel Committee uses Simply Voting for personnel actions. Please visit <http://johnjay.simplyvoting.com> before 9/20/24 to ensure your access is enabled. The FPC ballot will appear during Friday's meeting.

Login Credentials

Username: JJC email

Password: Password associated with your JJC email account

Upcoming FPC/FPAC Meetings – All meetings listed below are scheduled for in-person

Fall 2024

Full FPC

Friday, December 13, 2024 – 6.68 NB

Spring 2025

Full FPC

Friday, February 7, 2025 – 6.68 NB

Faculty Personnel Appeals Committee

Friday, March 7, 2025 ** - Rm.630 HH

Faculty Personnel Appeals Committee

Friday, March 14, 2025** - Rm.630 HH

Faculty Personnel Appeals Committee

Friday, March 21, 2025** - Rm.630 HH

Full FPC

Friday, April 4, 2025 – 6.68 NB

Full FPC

Friday, May 10, 2025 – 6.68 NB



FACULTY PERSONNEL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Friday, December 13, 2024 ~ 10:00 am – 12:00 pm

In-person: Moot Court (6.68 NB)

Meeting Convened: 10:09am

Meeting Adjourned: 11:51am

Open meeting attendees:

Michael Brownstein, Claudia Calirman, Anthony Carpi, Angela Crossman, Susannah Crowder, Geert Dhondt, Crystal Endsley Taylor, Gail Garfield, Jay Gates, Heath Grant, John Gutierrez, Richard Haw, Shweta Jain, Erica King-Toler, Ali Kocak, Vicente Lecuna, Maxwell Mak, Evan Mandery, Simone Martin-Howard, Karol Mason, Adam Mckible, Mickey Melendez, Jean Mills, Allison Pease, Nicholas Petraco, Jason Rivera, Jennifer Rosati, Stephen Russell, Ellen Sexton, Andrew Sidman, Edward Snajdr, John Staines, Daryl Wout, Myrna Forney, Jim Cauthen

9:30 am – 9:55 am – Meeting check-in/sign-in. *Light morning Refreshments provided*

Meeting Open to the Public 10:00 am – 11:30 am

- I. Welcome
- II. Approval of Minutes, 09/20/24 meeting***
Motion approved
- III. Discussion of Appeals Process and Proposal to Revise Appeals Process***
President Mason concluded that there is a need for further discussion on this topic. The following committee members agreed to continue the discussion and come back for the proposal: Evan M., Jim C., Michael B., Geert D., Mickey M., John S., Jennifer R., Shweta J., Jason R., and Erica K.
- IV. Discussion of Proposal for Enhancing Objectivity in Faculty Reviews?? ***
A vote for this proposal was not warranted
- V. New Business and Announcements

Executive Session – Full Faculty Personnel Committee 11:30 am – 12:00 pm

- Distinguished Professor Reappointment (1) (*Provost Pease*) ***

The Faculty Personnel Committee uses Simply Voting for personnel actions. Please visit <http://johnjay.simplyvoting.com> before 12/13/24 to ensure your access is enabled. The FPC ballot will appear during Friday's meeting.

Login Credentials

Username: JJC email

Password: Password associated with your JJC email account

*** Meeting materials (minutes; documents to inform discussion; revised proposal language; and materials for Executive Session) are in

11/25/24

**All times are approximate
**Appeals meetings are as needed.*

Dropbox: <https://www.dropbox.com/scl/fo/ge3hg5yow8ml9uv27lqzd/APvqVkQiLtxi8rTa166aK04?rlkey=4b8sb4k84qhxf50wvsh4qjqw&st=7t94b50u&dl=0>

Upcoming FPC/FPAC Meetings – All meetings listed below are scheduled for in-person

Spring 2025

Full FPC	Friday, February 7, 2025 – 6.68 NB
Faculty Personnel Appeals Committee	Friday, March 7, 2025 ** - Rm.630 HH
Faculty Personnel Appeals Committee	Friday, March 14, 2025** - Rm.630 HH
Faculty Personnel Appeals Committee	Friday, March 21, 2025** - Rm.630 HH
Full FPC	Friday, April 4, 2025 – 6.68 NB
Full FPC	Friday, May 10, 2025 – 6.68 NB



FACULTY PERSONNEL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Friday, February 7, 2025 ~ 10:00 am – 11:00 am

In-person: Moot Court (6.68 NB)

Meeting Convened: 10:06am

Meeting Adjourned: 10:59am

Open meeting attendees:

Michael Brownstein, Claudia Calirman, Anthony Carpi, Angela Crossman, Susannah Crowder, Crystal Endsley Taylor, Gail Garfield, Jay Gates, Heath Grant, John Gutierrez, Richard Haw, Shweta Jain, Erica King-Toler, Ali Kocak, Vicente Lecuna, Maxwell Mak, Evan Mandery, Simone Martin-Howard, Karol Mason, Adam Mckible, Mickey Melendez, Jean Mills, Allison Pease, Nicholas Petraco, Jason Rivera, Jennifer Rosati, Stephen Russell, Ellen Sexton, Andrew Sidman, Edward Snajdr, John Staines, Daryl Wout, Myrna Forney, Karen Kaplowitz

Zoom Link

For FPC members with approval to attend via zoom and guest.

<https://jjay-cuny.zoom.us/j/83617326765?pwd=TuyqqvbE90v3OZFFv21jByJFTFzamn.1>

Meeting ID: 836 1732 6765 Passcode: 825743

9:45 am – 9:55 am – Meeting check-in/sign-in.

Meeting Open to the Public 10:00 am – 10:20 am

- I. Welcome
- II. Approval of Minutes, 12/13/24 meeting*
Motion approved
- III. New Business and Announcements
 - FPC Processes Working group Update (*A. Crossman*)
 - Group will review the following 4 areas of concentration and return in April with a proposal:
 1. Timing of appeals and Presidential decisions in light of possible appeals
 2. Clarify service language in our FPPG
 3. Composition of appeals committee (small vs. large)
 4. Philosophical statement
 - FPC Committee Reporting (*A. Crossman*)
 - Review and Appeal Committee members will report on patterns, trends, good practices, and areas of concerns found throughout the personnel process. This is in an effort to keep the Full FPC better informed about decisions and processes.
 - Faculty Personnel Process Guidelines' language re Distinguished Professor
 - Committee listed ideas/suggestions of materials to submit with an initial sole nomination ballot:
 1. External letter

2. Teaching record
3. Chair nomination letter
4. P&B nomination vote
5. Evidence of awards
6. CV

-Vote of hands: confirmed that internal DP actions should continue to hold a two-step/vote system

- FPC Processes Working group, charged with: clarifying the language describing the process of Distinguished Prof cases

Executive Session – Full Faculty Personnel Committee 10:20 am – 10:50 am

- Distinguished Professor Nomination (1) (*Provost Pease*) *

The Faculty Personnel Committee uses Simply Voting for personnel actions. Please visit

<http://johnjay.simplyvoting.com> before 2/7/25 to ensure your access is enabled. The FPC ballot will appear during Friday's meeting.

Login Credentials

Username: *JJC email*

Password: *Password associated with your JJC email account*

*Meeting materials (minutes; documents to inform discussion; revised proposal language; materials for Executive Session, etc.) are in Dropbox:

https://www.dropbox.com/scl/fo/dm8ddi17vxxzyzz54h82a/AGERnSi0_smtYKkwyUepegg?rlkey=wh0qck3798ech65bt4amhqi4&st=azv5lzgx&dl=0

Upcoming FPC/FPAC Meetings – All meetings listed below are scheduled for in-person

Spring 2025

Faculty Personnel Appeals Committee

Full FPC

Full FPC

Friday, March 7, 2025 - 630 Haaren Hall

Friday, April 4, 2025 – 6.68 New Building

Friday, May 10, 2025 – 6.68 New Building



FACULTY PERSONNEL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Friday, April 4 2025 ~ 10:00 am – 12:00 pm

In-person: Moot Court (6.68 NB)

Meeting Convened: 10:08am (no quorum in room, but quorum with Zoom, 3 members on the way)

Meeting Adjourned: 11:48am

Open meeting attendees:

Michael Brownstein, Anthony Carpi, Angela Crossman, Susannah Crowder, Geert Dhondt, Crystal Endsley Taylor, Gail Garfield, Jay Gates, Heath Grant, John Gutierrez, Richard Haw, Shweta Jain, Erica King-Toler, Ali Kocak, Vicente Lecuna, Maxwell Mak, Evan Mandery, Simone Martin-Howard, Karol Mason, Adam Mckible, Mickey Melendez, Jean Mills, Allison Pease, Nicholas Petraco, Jason Rivera, Jennifer Rosati, Stephen Russell, Andrew Sidman, Edward Snajdr, John Staines, Daryl Wout, Myrna Forney, Karen Kaplowitz

Zoom Link

For FPC members with approval to attend via zoom and guest.

<https://jjay-cuny.zoom.us/j/84850283214?pwd=jbehTFiluBHbnVB1B2JBcwjXvbMlAc.1>

Meeting ID: 848 5028 3214 Passcode: 242800

9:45 am – 9:55 am – Meeting check-in/sign-in.

Meeting Open to the Public 10:00 am – 11:30 am

- I. Welcome
- II. Approval of Minutes, 02/07/25 meeting
Motion approved
- III. Personnel Process Ad Hoc Committee Report (*M. Brownstein and A. Crossman*)
 - 1) Service Clarification*
-Gail G. voiced concern over faculty in reappointment ranks, not being able to serve on college-wide committees. Faculty at these ranks mainly serve on department committees, as it may be more appropriate to their ranks. Michael B. agreed to clarify service expectations for different rank levels.
**Vote of hands: confirmed to adopt*
 - 2) Distinguished Professor Nomination Clarification*
-committee did not require discussion nor did members raise questions or concerns
**Vote of hands: confirmed to adopt*
 - 3) Personnel Process Revisions
-President Mason asked for clarification of 10-day appeals window (is it calendar days?). Michael B. will look into this.

-Provost Pease asked for a safeguard allowing only for a direct appeal to the President, if the candidate exhausted their other appeals process first. Kyeanna B. clarified that a direct appeal to the president is a safeguard in itself, meant to be used in the absence of a college's appeals mechanism. Since John Jay does have an appeals process, candidates should use it before a direct appeal to the President. She suggested updating our language to better reflect this standard.

-Committee expressed concern over the appeals compressed timeline.

-Richard H. noted that candidates have multiple chances to appeal. Michael B. stated, there is an expectation for candidates to appeal negative results. The process of each appeal, with each being looked at differently by different people, allows the candidates to decide what works best for them. In the end, the process should be faculty lead as much as possible.

-Committee supported the idea of having a "tick-box" form that candidates could fill-out when requesting an appeal. Although it was unclear if the candidate should also be allowed to submit a written statement or updated materials with the form.

-Committee requested that if any changes to the appeals process are approved, that they be detailed in the FPPG guidelines.

-Committee raised concerns over Chairs submitting a written letter of reasons that could potentially show bias, this could cause problems for Chairs. Committee was unsure on how best to keep such documentation confidential. Myrna F. shared that while there is a way to define the confidential process within our FPPG guidelines, certain items can still be considered "discoverable" should the College receive a grievance.

-Kyeanna B. inquired, if a candidate were to be given two "no's, and thus moved to another level of appeal, would they be able to write two statements? Committee would need to decide those specifics.

-President Mason acknowledged, the Committee's goal for the final decision not to come to her until a candidate has already gone through an appeal process first. She was supportive of adding language that indicates candidates do not have the right to a direct appeal, until they have gone through the appeals process. She also recommended adding a note that those changes are contingent upon the new collective bargaining agreement.

-Kyeanna B. described with caution, what this new process (if approved) would entail. She outlined the actions and timeframes for the Fall (reappointments, tenures, academic leaves, appeals, FPC/specials) and for the Spring (1st reappointments, promotions, academic leaves, appeals, adjunct reclassifications, FPC/specials). She also reminded the committee that Fall in particular, would be a tight window as final votes would need to be presented to the president before Dec 1 (or more accurately, prior to Thanksgiving as the college is usually closed for holiday in the last days of November). Spring in particular would also require a fuller schedule with the added promotion actions.

-Michael B. emphasized that the committee also had the option of doing nothing and instead keep the process as it stands today, should they all prefer it that way.

4) Constitution of Appeals Committee

-Committee had serious concerns over lack of representation (e.g. race, gender, rank, discipline, etc.) if only full professors made-up the appeals committee.

-John S. raised concerns about workload increase for these appeals members

5) Statement of Values*

-committee asked to remove "and only in extreme circumstances" and proposed to add the statement to the FPPG guidelines.

**Vote of hands: confirmed to adopt*

6) Bonus considerations

- Topic 1) P&B Chair writes letter of reasons for its vote. Committee concern(s): will the letters of reasons between committees be confidential? Myrna F. stated they are confidential only among the process. Many still have concerns about the letters showing bias and having that represented in a written document.
- Topic 2) FPC to hold annual “debrief”. Committee concern(s): committee did not require discussion nor did members raise questions or concerns

IV. New Business and Announcements

Kyeanna B. requested of President Mason, clarification/verification in writing of the following:

- Policy to conduct business in-person with Zoom members counting towards quorum (specifically those without prior certification to join remotely)
- Policy of voting rights for Zoom members (specifically those without prior certification to vote remotely)

Executive Session – Full Faculty Personnel Committee 11:30 am – 12:00 pm

I. Professor Emerita Exception (1)

II. Distinguished Professor Nomination (1)

The Faculty Personnel Committee uses Simply Voting for personnel actions. Please visit

<http://johnjay.simplyvoting.com> before 4/4/25 to ensure your access is enabled. The FPC ballot will appear during Friday’s meeting.

Login Credentials

Username: *JJC email*

Password: *Password associated with your JJC email account*

*Meeting materials (minutes; documents to inform discussion; materials for Executive Session, etc.) are in Dropbox:

<https://www.dropbox.com/scl/fo/92615zo9peebygxdj6tam/AJ6SnwzlPTN3pKetGvE8jY?rlkey=ajs9z6qofwhhmi9z4y9ytjim&st=zgmifxkk&dl=0>

Upcoming FPC Meetings – All meetings listed below are scheduled for in-person

Full FPC

Friday, May 9, 2025 – 6.68 New Building



FACULTY PERSONNEL COMMITTEE MINUTES

Friday, May 9 2025 ~ 10:00 am – 12:00 pm

In-person: Moot Court (6.68 NB)

Meeting Convened: 10:08 am

Meeting Adjourned: 12:20 pm

Open meeting attendees: Michael Brownstein, Claudia Calirman, Anthony Carpi, Angela Crossman, Geert Dhondt, Gail Garfield, Jay Gates, Heath Grant, John Gutierrez, Richard Haw, Shweta Jain, Ali Kocak, Vicente Lecuna, Maxwell Mak, Evan Mandery, Simone Martin-Howard, Karol Mason, Adam Mckible, Jean Mills, Allison Pease, Nicholas Petraco, Jason Rivera, Jennifer Rosati, Stephen Russell, Ellen Sexton, Andrew Sidman, Edward Snajdr, John Staines, Daryl Wout

Zoom Link For FPC members with approval to attend via zoom and guest.

<https://jjay-cuny.zoom.us/j/81267899035?pwd=hrc4ktFFMjTI6aQ0i9ez8JKqZDbxLr.1>

Meeting ID: 812 6789 9035 Passcode: 752344

9:45 am – 9:55 am – Meeting check-in/sign-in.

Meeting Open to the Public 10:00 am – 12:00 pm

I. Welcome

II. Approval of Minutes, 04/04/25 meeting

Motion Approved

III. Personnel Process Ad Hoc Committee Report-Updates (M. Brownstein and A. Crossman)

1) Constitution of Appeals Committee

-M. Brownstein suggests broader pool ensures better representation. New recommendation to expand FPAC to 9 members: 3 alternates (Provost/FS assigns alternate members), with rest being at either associate or full rank with previous FPC service.

-K. Bailey, on behalf of Faculty Services: The weight of your nastiness, and limits of your cooperation, have made us tired and frustrated. We are here to ensure CUNY and John Jay bylaws along with your Faculty Personnel Guidelines. These are protocols that you all create and task us with enforcing. Whatever you decide, you must show up, and you must do your assigned part. Please remember we're here to help.

-Provost Pease, in response to K. Bailey: I think it is important to honor the process and those trying to execute it as well. That has not always been consistent, and I am glad you mentioned it.

-Provost Pease, in terms of the committee size: large bodies do not work. Current configuration ensures attention, and is does not overemphasize service. People do not trust the process (as evidenced by the prior Appeals conversation). No need to humiliate appellants by making them sit in front of everyone they know.

-President Mason POLL: Full FPC FPAC vs. Small Group
Vote of hands: confirmed to keep Small Group

-President Mason POLL: Current practice of 7 vs. Proposal of 9
Vote of hands: confirmed to adopt Proposal of 9

-President Mason POLL: Accept Item 3 as presented (9 members, 4 full, 3 rotating at every level)
Vote of hands: confirmed to adopt Item 3

2) Personnel Process Revisions

-M. Brownstein gave P&B appeals overview of updated recommendations

-President Mason stated that appellants who choose not to appeal to FPAC, must meet with Dean of Faculty so that consent is informed. A. Crossman agrees, although still debating on deadlines staggered or fixed.

-President Mason POLL: President & Provost are to give an overview of FPAC deliberations to the Full FPC during its Executive Session (this practice will be added to the FPPG)
Vote of hands: confirmed to adopt appeals overview

IV. 2024-2025 Personnel Committee Overview (*A. Crossman*)

1) Department Chairs: Share experience regarding post-vote discussions with faculty

-S. Russell shared: Timing between adjunct reappt. deadlines, is too short.

2) Review Committee Chairs: Share concerns and feedback in terms of process and candidate materials

-J. Gates shared: remarkable, consistency across RCs, very reassuring

3) Trends, Feedback, Concerns, Process Gaps (open to all committee members)

-J. Mills shared: Nothing to say, but thank you. Process has improved and systems are much better. Kudos!

-A. Crossman shared: We voted on 96 actions, 96 out of 96 were positive. Thanks to the ADHOC Appeals committee. Will have language for ratification by Fall.

V. New Business and Announcements

*Meeting materials (minutes; documents to inform discussion; materials for Executive Session, etc.) are in Dropbox:
<https://www.dropbox.com/scl/fo/e8ezzycty3msyix6adxkt/AOcsBV4K6ls15tQA-9fgPqY?rlkey=fjihggqby0io1c2naic6hvg47&st=lf10xenl&dl=0>

2025-2026 FPC Schedule

Next year's calendar is in-progress. The calendar, voting deadlines, meetings and review committee assignments will be share with the 2025-2026 committee by the end of June 2025.